



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/677,179	10/02/2003	Rebecca E. Cahoon	BB1159 US DIV 1	8338
23906	7590	09/09/2005	EXAMINER	
E I DU PONT DE NEMOURS AND COMPANY LEGAL PATENT RECORDS CENTER BARLEY MILL PLAZA 25/1128 4417 LANCASTER PIKE WILMINGTON, DE 19805			BUI, PHUONG T	
			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
			1638	
DATE MAILED: 09/09/2005				

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary

Application No.

10/677,179

Applicant(s)

CAHOON ET AL.

Examiner

Phuong T. Bui

Art Unit

1638

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 14 July 2005.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 13-22 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 13-15 and 18-22 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☒ Claim(s) 16 and 17 is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☒ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
- Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).  
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some \* c) ☐ None of:
- ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
  - ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
  - ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- 1) ☒ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
- 3) ☒ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)  
Paper No(s)/Mail Date 6/1/04.
- 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413)  
Paper No(s)/Mail Date. \_\_\_\_\_
- 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
- 6) ☐ Other: \_\_\_\_\_

### **DETAILED ACTION**

1. The Office acknowledges the receipt of Applicant's restriction election filed July 14, 2005. Applicant elects Group I and SEQ ID NO:7 encoding SEQ ID NO:8 without traverse. Claims 13-22 are pending and are examined in the instant application. This restriction is made FINAL. Since SEQ ID NO:7 encoding SEQ ID NO:8 was first disclosed in Application No. PCT/US99/16353, Applicant shall have priority benefit of July 20, 1999 filing date.

### ***Sequence Listing***

2. Applicant's CRF and paper sequence listing have been entered. However, upon examination of SEQ ID NO:7 and its corresponding amino acid sequence SEQ ID NO:8, it is unclear what region of SEQ ID NO:7 encodes SEQ ID NO:8. Clarification is needed.

### ***Information Disclosure Statement***

3. An initialed and dated copy of Applicant's IDS form 1449, filed June 1, 2004, is attached to the instant Office action.

### ***Specification***

4. The disclosure is objected to because it contains an embedded hyperlink and/or other form of browser-executable code. Applicant is required to delete the embedded hyperlink and/or other form of browser-executable code. See MPEP § 608.01. See pages 5 and 16, for example.

### ***Drawings***

5. No drawings have been submitted in the instant application.

***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 112, first paragraph***

6. The following is a quotation of the first paragraph of 35 U.S.C. 112:

The specification shall contain a written description of the invention, and of the manner and process of making and using it, in such full, clear, concise, and exact terms as to enable any person skilled in the art to which it pertains, or with which it is most nearly connected, to make and use the same and shall set forth the best mode contemplated by the inventor of carrying out his invention.

7. Claims 13-15 and 18-22 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, first paragraph, because the specification, while being enabling for SEQ ID NO:7 or a sequence encoding SEQ ID NO:8, does not reasonably provide enablement for sequences having 80-95% sequence identity to SEQ ID NO:8. The specification does not enable any person skilled in the art to which it pertains, or with which it is most nearly connected, to practice the invention commensurate in scope with these claims. Claims reciting 80-95% sequence identity are not enabled because they encompass unspecified base substitutions, deletions, additions, and combinations thereof while retaining chorismate synthase activity. Neither the state of the prior art nor Applicant teaches what region of SEQ ID NO:7 or SEQ ID NO:8 must be retained for enzymatic activity. The claims encompass inoperable embodiments but the specification provided no guidance as to how such inoperable embodiments can be readily eliminated without undue experimentation. Moreover, while one skilled in the art can readily make mutations to SEQ ID NO:7 or the sequence encoding SEQ ID NO:8, further guidance is needed as to what mutations would not ablate enzymatic activity. Applicant provided no working example of any mutant sequences within the 80-95% sequence identity scope which has the asserted activity. Accordingly, the claimed invention cannot be practiced without undue experimentation as commensurate in scope with the claims.

8. Claims 13-15 and 18-22 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, first paragraph, as failing to comply with the **written description** requirement. The claim(s) contains subject matter which was not described in the specification in such a way as to reasonably convey to one skilled in the relevant art that the inventor(s), at the time the application was filed, had possession of the claimed invention. The claims reciting 80-95% sequence identity lack adequate written description because Applicant does not disclose a representative number of species as encompassed by these claims. The claims encompass mutants and allelic variants and thus imply that structural variants exist in nature, yet no structural variant has been disclosed. The claims also encompass chorismate synthase sequences from other species. The implication is that there is a gene and a protein other than that disclosed which exists in nature, but the structure thereof is not known. Applicant discloses a single sequence SEQ ID NO:7 isolated from *Zea mays*. Thus, there are insufficient relevant identifying characteristics to allow one skilled in the art to predictably determine such mutants, allelic variants and chorismate synthase sequences from other plants and organisms, absent further guidance. Accordingly, there is lack of adequate description to inform a skilled artisan that Applicant was in possession of the claimed invention at the time of filing. See Written Description guidelines published in Federal Register/ Vol.66, No. 4/ Friday, January 5, 2001/ Notices; p. 1099-1111.

**Remarks**

9. Claims 16 and 17 are objected to as being dependent on rejected claims but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form. SEQ ID Nos. 7 and 8 are free of


Art Unit: 1638

the prior art. The closest prior art teaches a sequence from *Lycopersicon esculentum* which has 70% sequence identity with SEQ ID NO:8 (Goerlach et al. Plant Mol. Biol., Vol. 23:697-706, 1993 (Applicant's IDS)).

10. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Phuong T. Bui whose telephone number is 571-272-0793. If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Gary Jones can be reached on 571-272-0745. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

9/1/05

  
Phuong T. Bui  
Primary Examiner  
Art Unit 1638  
9/2/05